

The SAC has the following specific suggestions regarding the ESS data policy documents:

FAIR_data_policy_SAC 20221027.pdf

There are two Section 1.1s in the document. For the one titled Revisions, it is unclear as written if changes made to the policy will impose retroactive requirements on users to provide information or alterations (see clause 1.1.3).

The section numbering has been fixed such that the section titled Revisions is now Section 2.1.

1.2.4 has been added and clarifies that retrospective changes should be avoided

1.2.5 clarifies which version of the data policy that covers specific data. It implicitly states that changes are not retroactive unless actively decided to be so.

Several clauses deal with persistent identifiers, such as DOIs, (clauses 1.5.2, 2.4, 3.2). Clauses 2.4 and 3.2 establish that persistent identifiers will be created for raw data and processed data generated using ESS hardware/software resources. Clause 1.5.2 states that members of the proposal team 'can create' a persistent identifier for one or more specific datasets to be cited in a publication. The SAC suggests either eliminating Clause 1.5.2, or replacing it with a statement like: "ESS will ensure that persistent identifiers (e.g. Digital Object Identifiers) are created for specific data sets."

For Clause 3.2, the SAC suggests rewording as "ESS will generate persistent data identifiers for processed data generated by ESS-maintained systems, on demand of the proposal team." The addition is the "on demand of the proposal team". This is to avoid all processed data being included with a DOI as much of it will be temporary in nature, as discussed during the meeting.

From the comments above it is clear that the wording has not been sufficiently accurate. A new section 1.8 titled "Digital Object Identifiers" is now added. A DOI is automatically created per proposal by the ESS system and users can also create a DOI for a select set of data sets. Each of the data sets has a persistent identifier, which is only findable through the meta data catalogue, whereas the DOIs are findable and citeable through a web address. That is now explained in the GLOSSARY.

In Section 5 on results, Section 5.1 is concerned with intellectual property rights. Should the phrase 'users' in this clause instead refer to the 'Proposal Team'?

Correct, it has been changed

Guidelines for Scientific Data_SAC_20221027.pdf

In Section 2 (Good Practice), second paragraph, the last sentence reads: "In the absence of a facility electronic logbook, the experimental team must use other means (electronic if possible) and link the logbook to the scientific research data."

The SAC suggests altering this to following:

"In the absence of a facility electronic logbook, the experimental team must use other means and link a read-only copy of the logbook to the raw data."

The SAC would also like to ask if there is the intention to provide a log file in each case of all commands/interventions, as this can be very useful and would provide a first automatic step to fulfilling the requirement to provide a complete log of the 'protocol carried out', independent of the actions of the proposal team.

This is currently not in the pipeline but can change if there is a strong desire for doing so and found to be feasible. However, please note that the physical state of the experiment will be recorded and saved.

Another change should be mentioned. A reviewer of the Data Policy has pointed out that ESS cannot know what users will put in their files (e.g., a phone number in a logbook). For that reason, ESS cannot guarantee that all data are GDPR compliant. We have there updated 1.5.2 and added 1.5.3, where 1.5.3 requests that information provided by users is GDPR compliant.

Finally, we would like to thank the SAC for its engagement into this topic and its constructive feedback, which has been very helpful. As commented by the SAC a year ago, the data policy should be considered to be a document that can change in the future and most likely will change as we gain experience with real data.